

Shannon Christy

Soc 6900

4/21/2013

Estrada, Gabriel S. 2011. "Two Spirits, Nádleeh, and LGBTQ2 Navajo Gaze." *American Indian Culture and Research Journal* 35(4):104-18.

talks about the representation of Native American two spirited individuals within recent films. The article mostly focuses on the film *Two Spirits*, and how the concept is presented by a Euro-American director regarding the story of a 16 year old Navajo two spirited individual named Fred Martinez that was murdered in a hate crime. The article both praises the representation of the centrality of dual spirits and sexuality within Navajo culture, and its contrast to the hetero-normative and binary ideologies of Western culture.

The author describes the representations and involvement of two spirited individuals within the film *Two Spirits*. They praise the use of narrative voice and centering of Martinez's mother at the center of the movie, a representation of a mother who fully accepted her child for the person they were. Martinez identified as *nadleeh* and the author includes two reviews of the film by individuals who as identify as such. Both praised the film for its representation and the voice it provided to individuals such as themselves. The author also notes the connection of the male and female spirits to the physical differences in the landscapes of Navajo land. The introduction of the movie itself is done by a two spirited individual named Wesley Thomas.

The author however also critiques the dichotomy sometimes created between Native and Western culture. While these differences are necessary to understand they are sometimes overemphasized. The film accurately shows how Western culture has affected even native individual's perceptions of *nadleeh*, quoting how one native leader even called them an abomination and bad seeds

within the community. The authors also criticize the dichotomy the film creates between Westerners as factual and practical and Natives as emotional and spiritual. The article also questions the lack of involvement of two spirit organizations in the case and story. The author also points out that the film exposes the gap in reaching a common ground between Western LGBTQ and Two-Spirited communities and organizations.

The author also discusses how the film brings the need to address both LGBTQ and Native issues to the forefront. Tribal police need to be trained to deal with both issues. They expose the need to create a way to deal with these issues from within the community, rather than bring outside organization in which would deal with the situations in a way which would very likely be culturally insensitive. The author also criticizes the lack of feminist and accurate representation of Martinez's mother Mitchell, and her strong and powerful Navajo woman activist role. The film instead emphasizes her as the emotional in contrast to the political and active Western LGBTQ organizations, when in actuality she acted with them. The film is also criticized for potential links to the Western attempts to appropriate Native religions and spiritual beliefs and systems for their own use. While the film included gay and *nadleeh* identified voices, it lacked the voice of any transgender individuals. Martinez was known to identify as transgender, *nadleeh*, and gay at different times, showing a fluidity of identity not found in Western society. However, the fluidity may not fully represent the concept of *nadleeh* either. The film did however, provide some of the first statistics specifically on violence and harassment faced by nonheteronormative Native individuals- 72% of which are physically assaulted in K-12. This shows a clear demarcation between traditional acceptance and Western emphasis on heteronormativity. The author concludes by explaining the role that the short *Miss Indian Transgender Arizona Crowned* plays that *Two Spirits* didn't, representing the pride and activism of the transgender or two-Spirited individuals themselves.